

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

OVERALL CONSENSUS RECOMMENDATIONS

Action Items

Recommendation #1: We recommend that the NAC be briefed by an appropriate expert at OMB about potential changes to Statistical Directive 15 and their implications for the 2020 census "race or ethnicity" question.

Census Bureau Response:

In September 2016, the U.S. Office of Management and Budget (OMB) issued a Federal Register Notice to advise the public that it was undertaking a limited review of the 1997 standards for race/ethnicity. The Census Bureau Director and Census Bureau researchers have been working with OMB and fellow Federal statistical agencies over the past several years to explore alternatives for improving data on race and ethnicity. We will refer questions to Dr. Nancy Potok, Chief Statistician of the United States (OMB) and Dr. Jennifer Park, Senior Statistician (OMB). Census Bureau Director Thompson understands the importance of this recommendation and he will help to facilitate a discussion with OMB and the National Advisory Committee about potential changes to the race/ethnicity standards.

Recommendation #2: We recommend that the Census Bureau convene the NAC, ideally in person, in a timely manner to talk specifically about the National Content Test so the NAC may provide recommendations at a point relative to the OMB submission. If the NAC does not meet until April 2017, it may be too late.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau appreciates the support and great interest of the National Advisory Committee with the 2015 National Content Test (NCT) research efforts for improving race/ethnicity data. Our goal with releasing preliminary results from the NCT research during the Fall of 2016 was to facilitate early discussions with our Census Bureau advisors, key stakeholder organizations, the U.S. Office of Management and Budget (OMB), Federal agency colleagues, and the general public. This positive discourse continues to be a critical component for enhancing the dialogue and understanding of these complex issues that are being researched.

The Census Bureau expects that the OMB review of the standards will continue well into 2017, and that this review will afford ample opportunities for public comment.

Currently, the 2015 NCT Race and Ethnicity Analysis Report is nearing the completion of internal Census Bureau review and clearance, and we are planning to release the report at the end of February 2017. In advance of the report release, we are convening a one-way briefing for the National Advisory Committee (NAC) and the Census Scientific Advisory

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

Committee (CSAC) to familiarize our advisors with the report. We will also send the NCT report and related materials to NAC and CSAC members when they are released. After that, we plan to continue discussions by convening virtual meetings with NAC and CSAC members in March to discuss their review of the NCT report and hear their feedback on the results. Additionally, during the Spring 2017 NAC meeting and Spring 2017 CSAC meeting we will host sessions on the 2015 NCT research to facilitate further discussion.

We look forward to engaging with our advisors on this critical research undertaking for improving data on our Nation's diverse racial/ethnic populations.

Recommendation #3: We recommend that the NAC receive another briefing on the 2016 tests (Los Angeles and Harris Counties) once the analysis of the experiments is complete.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau agrees to provide another briefing on the 2016 tests once the analysis is completed.

Recommendation #4: We recommend that all NAC recommendations to the director be compiled in a side-by-side table with recommendations in one column and Census Bureau responses in the other column so that NAC members know which recommendations have been responded to and which have not.

For example, a NAC member recalled a recommendation to start a Nation to Nation working group was proposed several meetings ago and it would be nice to have a document that shows when that recommendation was made and its current status (as denied, under review, approved, etc.)

Census Response: Thank you for your suggestion, in its Fall 2016 Census Responses, the Census will employ the suggested side-by-side, columnar format for the NAC's consideration in terms of navigability and usefulness.

Also, in response to your example, the NAC member forwarded the recommendation for a "government to government" working group during the Fall 2015 meeting. The Census Bureau responded in its 2015 Fall meeting responses on page two of the attached link:

<https://www2.census.gov/cac/nac/meetings/2015-10-13/2016-06-20-census-responses.pdf>

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

NCT

Recommendation #5: That the Bureau consider other alternatives to the three current options for terminology regarding a combined race/ethnicity question, such as "racial/ethnic background," to ensure that non-literal concept translations into other languages are effective.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau's 2015 National Content Test (NCT) research on race/ethnicity has shown that the three different terminology concepts tested ("race or origin," "race or ethnicity," and no terms at all "categories") all performed well. In fact, there were not discernable differences among the terminology variations, in terms of their impact on the reporting of race/ethnicity responses. However, what did have a significant impact on race/ethnicity reporting was question format, wherein the combined question with multiple detailed checkboxes format yielded the same or more accurate race/ethnicity reporting than the two separate questions approach.

Additionally, with respect to the variations of terminology that were tested in the 2015 NCT, one of the important findings from the research came through the examination of the results in English and Spanish, as the research was fielded in both languages. Based on the robust results of the 2015 NCT research, and the evaluation of related qualitative research on the impact of different question terminology in English and in Spanish, our research concluded that it is optimal to use the "race or ethnicity" terminology with the combined question as the most effective wording for English and Spanish data collections.

The Census Bureau currently uses a process of pretesting translated materials, including joint usability and cognitive testing of questionnaires and materials in non-English languages. The goal of this pre-testing is to obtain feedback from respondents on translated wording. Participants are recruited from various regions of the country, are demographically diverse (age, gender, etc.), have diverse education levels and household compositions, and have varying levels of English proficiency. Feedback from cognitive testing is used to create standardized translation glossaries, which are used consistently across all non-English materials.

Recommendation #6: That, in public outreach regarding the possibility of combining the race and Hispanic origin questions, the Bureau must include a clear articulation of its tabulation plans with respect to race/ethnicity and how those tabulation plans might change based upon the OMB determination.

Census Bureau Response:

As we release and discuss the results of the 2015 NCT, and discuss plans and preparations for the 2020 Census, the Census Bureau will definitely articulate, as well as elicit feedback on, our race/ethnicity data tabulation plans. Our goal for the 2020 Census is to provide not only comparable race/ethnicity data tabulations to those produced for the 2010 Census – for

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

example, counts and distributions of major groups (White, Hispanic, Black, Asian, AIAN, NHPI, SOR, Multiple-Race), detailed groups (e.g., Mexican, Chinese, Navajo, Native Hawaiian, etc.), and multiple-race groups (e.g., White *and* Black; Black *and* Asian) – but also new tabulations for the Middle Eastern or North African (MENA) population, as well as new data for detailed White groups (e.g., German, Irish), detailed Black groups (e.g., Jamaican, Haitian), and detailed MENA groups (e.g., Lebanese, Egyptian).

We are considering different options for the tabulation of detailed responses, but at this time, no recommendations or final decisions have been made for the 2020 Census. The Census Bureau welcomes and appreciates the advice and support of the National Advisory Committee on this important topic.

Recommendation #7: We recommend that the Census Bureau alter the checkbox title “Asian” to read “Asian or Asian American.”

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau follows the 1997 OMB Standards for Race and Ethnicity, which prescribe the official names of the race and ethnicity categories. Currently, the OMB standards define this category as “Asian,” and that is the official category name that the Census Bureau employs for standard data collections and tabulations.

Recommendation #8: We recommend that the Census Bureau Director urge OMB to wait until the release of the final results of the 2015 National Content Test before issuing its proposed revisions to its Standards.

8a. We recommend that the Census Bureau Director urge OMB to provide at least 90 days from the date of publication of the Federal Register notice for the public to comment on its proposed revisions to its Standards in order for the public, including the NAC, to have an adequate amount of time to analyze the findings of the NCT, understand its implications and propose recommendations on the proposed revisions before OMB publishes its final Standards.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau Director and Census Bureau researchers have been working with OMB and our fellow Federal statistical agencies over the past several years to explore ways for improving data on race and ethnicity. In September 2016, the U.S. Office of Management and Budget (OMB) issued a Federal Register Notice (FRN) to advise the public that it would be undertaking a limited review of the 1997 standards for race/ethnicity. OMB advised the public that they may issue subsequent notices to elicit public comment.

The Census Bureau expects that the OMB review of the standards will continue well into 2017, and that this review will afford ample opportunities for public comment. Currently, the 2015 NCT Race and Ethnicity Analysis Report is nearing the completion of internal Census Bureau review and clearance, and we are planning to release the report at the end of

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

February 2017. The Census Bureau is developing plans to discuss the results with Census Bureau Advisory Committees, key stakeholder groups, and the public.

A large component of the OMB and Federal Interagency Working Group deliberations focus on the research and results of the 2015 NCT findings, with respect to ways for improving race/ethnicity data in the Federal statistical system. The public will have access to the 2015 NCT report, results, and recommendations, and this will help inform public knowledge and discussions moving forward. As the Census Bureau continues this important work, we appreciate the ongoing advice and support of the National Advisory Committee on this critical topic.

MENA

Recommendation #9: We recommend that the use of MENA on the ACS questionnaire does not impede coverage of Arabic and other southwestern Asian languages under Section 203(e) of the Voting Rights Act (52 USC 10503(e)) as an "Asian American language" (the statutory term used in Section 203), if appropriate.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau's 2015 National Content Test research has shown demonstrated the merits of using a combined race/ethnicity question with detailed checkboxes that includes a dedicated Middle Eastern or North African (MENA) response category. This question design should not impact the classification and tabulation of language data collected in the ACS. Section 203(e) of the Voting Rights Act (52 USC 10503(e)) provides the list of political subdivisions that are obligated to provide language assistance. Currently, Section 203 does not implement the Arabic language, therefore, inclusion of MENA response category under the race/ethnicity question will not impact Section 203(e) of the Voting Rights Act. No final decisions on the inclusion of a MENA category in the 2020 Census or future American Community Survey data collections have been made at this time.

Recommendation #10: We recommend that the Census Bureau clarify the ways in which MENA responses will be tabulated.

Census Bureau Response:

The U.S. Office of Management and Budget (OMB) is currently conducting a review of the 1997 Standards on Race and Ethnicity, including an examination of how MENA responses are collected, classified, and tabulated. We are considering different options for the tabulation of detailed MENA responses, but under the current OMB standards, detailed MENA responses are aggregated to the White category. Thus, at this time, no recommendations have been made as to how data for the MENA population will be classified and tabulated in the 2020 Census. It will ultimately be OMB's decision as to whether or not a MENA category will become a new "minimum" reporting category, separate from the White category.

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

As these decisions are made, the Census Bureau will be able to clarify and discuss preparations for 2020 Census data tabulations as they pertain to Middle Eastern and North African responses. The Census Bureau appreciates the advice and support of the National Advisory Committee on this important topic.

Communications

Recommendation #11: We recommend that the Census Bureau invite all communication contractors that target HTC populations as appropriate to NAC meetings.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau will ensure that invitations to the National Advisory Committee meetings are extended to all communications contractors that target hard-to-count populations.

Recommendation #12: We recommend that the Bureau consider and evaluate multiple potential first-mailing inserts for specific communities that would maximize early-response rates from specific communities, including language communities.

Census Bureau Response:

During our 2020 research, the Census Bureau has provided respondents with materials that explain the purpose of the tests, benefits of participating, and different methods of participating online, by telephone, and on paper. The non-English materials have included several letters, an informational insert explaining the Census Questionnaire Assistance support in several languages, postcards, multilingual brochures, and bilingual questionnaires. These materials were translated to support languages and provide information about why and how to participate.

We are working to refine the non-English materials planned for the 2020 Census to help reduce language barriers to enumeration, ensure consistency across languages, and promote high response rates and accurate/consistent responses from respondents of Limited English Proficiency (LEP). We are also measuring self-response in the supported languages to help enhance non-English materials and messaging about these response options for the 2020 Census.

Recommendation #13: We recommend that the Bureau consult and involve the Y&R team in designing and testing specific inserts or language for first mailing to specific communities that would maximize response rate to first mailing.

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

Census Bureau Response:

We are beginning work with the Integrated Partnership and Communication area on dovetailing self-response mailings with the larger communication campaign.

RESIDENCE CRITERIA

Recommendation #14: We strongly recommend that the Census Bureau (Bureau) change its Proposed 2020 Census Residence Criteria and Residence Situations Rule, the “usual residence,” rule, to count inmates as part of their home community and not at the correctional facility where they are incarcerated. The Bureau’s proposal to count inmates in their prison location rather than their home community does not provide an accurate representational count for the more than 2 million people in detention centers, state and federal prisons.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau published a *Federal Register Notice* on June 30, 2016, outlining the *Proposed 2020 Census Residence Criteria and Residence Situations*. Thank you for sharing your concerns regarding the proposal. We are taking into consideration all public comments (almost 78,000) received through the September 1, 2016 deadline, including your input. We will continue to engage stakeholders through an open and transparent process. The Census Bureau plans to publish final 2020 Residence Criteria and Residence Situations in 2017. We appreciate your thoughtful input and will keep you apprised of further developments.

Integrated Partnership and Communications Working Group Recommendations

1. We recognize that the Partnerships Program has more impact on reaching Hard to Count populations than nearly any other single program run by the Bureau. As the Bureau makes funding decisions regarding the 2020 Census, we strongly urge that staffing for the Partnerships Program equal or exceed the staffing levels in 2010.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau will continue to request funds for a robust Community Partnership and Engagement (CPEP) Program and National Partnership program. We appreciate the Committee’s support.

2. Build upon the existing faith-based partnerships program by intentionally increasing the quantity and quality of partnerships with faith communities in geographic areas with low Hot Tract Scores and with faith-based organizations that primarily serve hard to count populations. The faith-based partnerships strategy should reflect all denominations with a presence in the U.S.

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau will continue our initiative with faith-based community organizations and churches of all denominations and we appreciate the Committee's support.

3. Increase the quantity and quality of partnerships with organizations that serve immigrant and foreign-born communities, with a particular focus on organizations that serve populations not covered by non-English materials.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau will continue to focus communication efforts on hard-to-count communities, including immigrants and foreign-born populations. The Census Bureau will concentrate on non-English materials, and reach out to trusted organizations supporting these populations.

4. Increase the quantity and quality of partnerships with organizations that serve the lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, and queer (LGBTQ) community, with a particular emphasis on organizations that focus on LGBTQ people of color.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau will continue to work with organizations that serve lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, and queer (LGBTQ) communities.

5. Increase the quality and quantity of partnerships with American Indian/Alaska Native (AI/AN) groups, including national membership organizations like the National Congress of American Indians and the Native American Indian Housing Council, as well as regional organizations like the Alaska Federation of Natives, tribal associations, and Tribal Councils.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau has a very robust American Indian and Alaska Native (AIAN) program. This is an ongoing initiative working with federal- and state-recognized tribes, nonrecognized tribes, as well as national and regional organizations reaching the populations living on and off tribal lands. We began our initiative with 18 tribal consultations and hiring of eight partnership specialists working with the AIAN population to support these efforts. We are selecting Partnership Specialists earlier this decade to ensure we are developing quality relationships. The AIAN program consists of the Tribal Government Liaison Program, Tribal Complete Count Committees, and regional and national organizations.

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

6. Create a strategy to partner with advocacy organizations and service providers that work with very low-income communities, including homeless drop-in centers, mental and behavioral health service providers, and community centers.

Census Bureau Response:

As part of the Community Partnership and Engagement Program, reaching out and developing partnerships with advocacy organizations and service providers that work with low-income communities is a key part of the program. We will include work with homeless drop-in centers, mental and behavioral health services providers, and community centers.

7. As RFPs are designed for media buys, we urge the Bureau to prioritize media outlets that are reaching unique users, rather than media outlets that are reaching the same users through multiple outlets. As an example, ethnic and youth media outlets may be the primary media for a set of users who would not be reached by any other media source.

Census Bureau Response:

Working with Team Y&R, the Census Bureau will evaluate all media outlets to ensure that all media buys are as efficient and effective as possible, while also ensuring that all media purchased adhere to media evaluation criteria. It is our goal to obtain the best value possible, including reaching unique users. Best value is determined by evaluating several factors (such as appropriateness, price, delivery capabilities, past performance, quality, reach, financial stability, etc.) and selecting vendors that offer the best combination of these factors.

8. Partnership Specialists were an integral part of the success of the 2010 Partnerships Program. To optimize the value of this role in the 2020 Census, we urge the Bureau to focus hiring outreach on attracting people who are members of hard to count communities, who have a nuanced understanding of the NGO landscape in their assigned area, and who have language skills. We encourage the Bureau to expand the criteria used to make Partnership Specialist hiring decisions in order to reflect the skills the Bureau needs most.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau will continue to recruit and hire staff with experience in hard-to-count communities and public service areas. As we did in 2010, we plan to recruit staff for partnership with various language skills in order to ensure the ability to communicate with non-English speaking communities.

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

9. We support the Bureau's intention to support Complete Count Committees in every state and many large municipal areas. We urge the Bureau to:

- a. Designate funding for regional directors to assist with establishment of the Complete Count Committees.

Census Bureau Response:

One of the responsibilities of the Partnership Specialists will continue to be supporting the establishment of Complete Count Committees,

- b. Offer matching funds to states and municipalities that offer hard-to-count partnership programs and outreach, and

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau does not provide grants or funds; however, Partnership Specialists will support and provide materials to assist in establishing Complete Count Committees.

- c. Ensure adequate Partnership Specialist staffing to assist with establishment and work of the Complete Count Committees.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau intends to hire Partnership Specialists to assist state and local governments and community organizations with establishing CCCs throughout the country. Beginning in FY 2017, Partnership staff were hired and have been working on establishing Complete Count Committees.

10. The target demographics that the Bureau focuses on in the 2020 Partnerships Program – as well as in Communications programs – should reflect the populations identified in the NAC's Hard to Count Working Group recommendations. Hard to Count populations in the report included:

- a. Racial and ethnic minorities,
- b. People who are not fluent in English,
- c. Lower-income people,
- d. People experiencing homelessness or housing instability,
- e. Immigrants, especially those who are undocumented
- f. Young and mobile people
- g. Children, especially very young children
- h. "Cynical Fifth" – people who are angry with or distrustful of the government
- i. LGBTQ people

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations
Fall Meeting
U.S. Census Bureau
4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746
November 3-4, 2016

- j. People staying in group living situations not counted in group quarters.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau's Community Partnership Engagement Program continues the initiatives implemented in 2010, including targeting young children, emerging and special populations, foreign-born/immigrants, disabilities, veterans, and homeless/transitory people. Each of the CPEP initiatives will include census messages, written promotional materials, and promotional items designed specially to reach out to these populations.

11. Create an outreach strategy that specifically targets people who are illiterate or have low literacy skills in either English or non-English languages that highlights telephone assistance and the availability of phone response options.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau fully intends to use multiple outreach strategies to encourage response by any response options (Internet, paper, telephone questionnaire assistance). This includes specific efforts to reach segments of the population that are linguistically isolated, have little to no Internet access, and those with limited literacy skills. We will employ mass communication, hyperlocal messaging, and digital advertising in combination with efforts of the Partnership Staff to reach everyone and encourage them to respond to the 2020 Census.

12. Create a strategy to partner with advocacy organizations and service providers that work with people who are involved with the criminal legal system, including alternatives to incarceration programs, reentry services (both in incarceration facilities and in communities), and organizations that work with families of people who have spent time in incarceration.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau will include outreach to advocacy groups and service providers that work with the criminal legal system and associated programs. We will include organizations that work with families of people who have spent time in incarceration.