



UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
U.S. Census Bureau
Office of the Director
Washington, DC 20233-0001

NOV - 1 2019

MEMORANDUM FOR: Julie Dowling
Chair
Census National Advisory Committee

From: Steven D. Dillingham
Director
U.S. Census Bureau

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Steven D. Dillingham".

Subject: U.S. Census Bureau Responses to 2019 Spring Census National
Advisory Committee Recommendations

The U.S. Census Bureau thanks the Census National Advisory Committee for its recommendations. We are responding to the committee recommendations submitted during its May 2-3, 2019, meeting.

Your expertise is necessary to ensure that the Census Bureau continues to provide relevant and timely statistics used by federal, state, and local governments, as well as business and industry, in an increasingly technologically oriented society.

Attachment

**National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations
Spring 2019 Meeting Recommendations***

To: Steve Dillingham, Director of the Census Bureau

Submitted by: Carol Gore, NAC Chair

Date: Friday, May 3, 2019

All recommendations submitted were reached by consensus vote

Section I. Update on the 2020 Census

1. The NAC requests that the Census Bureau demo to the NAC the hand held device version of the 2020 Census questionnaire and the mobile devices it will use in the field during the 2020 Census enumeration by July 2019.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau has arranged for a demo of the internet response instrument with the NAC members at the November 2019 meeting.

2. The NAC requests that the Census Bureau provide quarterly reports on the number of partnership specialists who are hired, who are bilingual and fluent in a non-English language, dialect of that language (if applicable), and by ACO.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau will provide reports on partnership specialist hiring at the NAC's spring and fall meetings. Languages spoken by partnership staff include: Assyrian, Bengali, Chinese, Comanche, French, Ga, Haitian Creole, Hebrew, Hindi, Italian, Japanese, Keres, Kootenai, Korean, Kpelle, Mandarin, Native Hawaiian, Navajo, Oglala/Lakota, Polish, Portuguese, Punjabi, Rosebud Sioux, Russian, Spanish, Tagalog, Twi, Urdu, Ute, and Vietnamese.

3. The NAC recommends that to the maximum extent practicable, that in-field address canvassing be used in Hard-To-Count and tribal areas.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

In-field address canvassing was completed in October 2019.

4. The NAC recommends that the Census Bureau establish and staff Questionnaire Assistance Centers (QACs) and that they be prioritized for Hard-To-Count communities and tribal areas.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau did not originally plan to establish Questionnaire Assistance Centers (QACs) in the 2020 Census because the introduction of a non-ID online response option made them unnecessary.

However, Congress asked the Census Bureau to provide it with a proposal for increased partnership and outreach. We have indicated as part of that proposal that, should additional funding be provided, we would be prepared to mount a mobile response initiative that would deploy Mobile Questionnaire Assistance Centers (M-QACs) to hard-to-count locations across the country. At these M-QACs, respondents could get assistance from trained staff, and they could answer the census then and there. Because this effort is not tied to specific physical locations, the M-QACs could be deployed dynamically where they are most needed.

5. The NAC recommends that QACs have workers who are bilingual and fluent in the languages and dialects of the populations served by those QACs.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

QACs were used in the 2010 Census. With the introduction of non-ID online and telephone response to the 2020 Census, the need for QACs has diminished. However, the Census Bureau recognizes the need to encourage participation in low response areas. While Congress has not yet passed a FY 2020 appropriations bill, the Census Bureau anticipates that funding will be provided and has begun early planning for a mobile response initiative for the 2020 Census to set up a program for Mobile Questionnaire Assistance Centers (M-QACs). Where appropriate, we will leverage the language skills of our partnership staff in the M-QACs.

6. The NAC recommends that the Kalaimoku Group extend media messaging to geographic NHPI enclaves in the continental USA, given that the objective of NHPI outreach and communications is not just to encourage a complete count of NHPIs in Hawai'i, but throughout the continental US where the majority of NHPI reside.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Kalaimoku Group (TKG) working through Team Y&R and the Integrated Partnership and Communications Campaign, has a plan to reach Native Hawaiians and other Pacific Islanders living in Hawaii and in the continental U.S through paid media and partnership effort.

7. The NAC recommends that the Bureau translate the "confidentiality pledge" into easily accessible language in English and all languages for which the Bureau provides materials. It should also be included in all published language guides, language assistance materials developed through local partnership specialists or community groups.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau is already planning to include introductory information about the 2020 Census, including information about respondent confidentiality, in the language guides. The text will explain that 1) responses are confidential, 2) federal law protects responses, 3)

responses can only be used to produce summary table statistics, and 4) an individual's responses cannot be used against them by any government agency or court. The Census Bureau will also produce language glossaries that include key confidentiality terms that can be used by local partnership specialists and community members.

8. NAC recommends that the Census Bureau provide promotional materials in more languages than the 12 non-English languages currently supported for the 2020 Census online and telephonic response options. We further recommend that, at a minimum, the Bureau provide promotional materials in the languages supported in 2010 for promotional materials.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Integrated Partnership and Communications Program has planned for outreach materials in all the languages selected for the 2020 Census operation. We are also developing basic content for the website on the 59 languages that will be supported through language guides. Additionally, we are relying on the skill set provided by our partnership specialists that most likely will cover over 100 languages. The 13 languages supported in the 2020 Census actually exceed the 2010 Census baseline and support 99% of the nation's households.

9. NAC recommends the Bureau utilize community-based organizations to conduct a community review as part of its translation process for all languages, including for translations that have already been completed. This will help ensure translations are technically correct, understandable, culturally appropriate and effective.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau does not accept this recommendation. The Census Bureau has a robust system in place that uses professional translators, reviewers, and multilingual researchers. In 2016, the Census Bureau created the Decennial Translation Branch to standardize the quality, style, and terminology of translations. The Census Bureau has hired professional translators and follows industry best practices for quality assurance to ensure all translated materials are accurate, meaningful, culturally relevant, and easily understood by respondents.

10. NAC recommends the following terms should be included for translation in the language glossaries: lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, sexual orientation, gender identity.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau does not accept this recommendation. The language glossaries were created using key terms that were professionally translated and pretested for 2020 Census questionnaires, letters, and field materials. No additional terms were added to ensure consistency and quality in the terminology across materials.

11. The NAC recommends that during the self-response phase, the Bureau provide daily reports on responses rates at the smallest geography possible, ensuring confidentiality, at minimum to the Census block group level.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau is developing an online, interactive mapping tool to display self-response rates during the 2020 Census. This map will show total self-response rates and internet self-response rates across numerous levels of geographies, as well as provide the underlying self-response rate data to the public via an application programming interface (API). Data will be available at the tract level, subject to disclosure protections. The interactive mapping tool will not provide self-response rates at the block group level.

12. The NAC recommends that in areas with low broadband coverage, or low subscription rates, that they consider working with cell phone companies to rent a Cell-on-Wheels (COW) to provide Wi-Fi or internet access on all Saturdays and Sundays during the last week of March and in April. At the very least, for customers who have federal Lifeline coverage on their cell phones, that their cell phone minutes be considered neutral (so they are not charged) or make the Census Bureau's 800 numbers be minute neutral during the months of March and April.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

We are reaching out to many private sector entities as part of our National Partnership Program. We will explore all of the ways that they can support the 2020 Census, including the suggestions offered by the NAC.

13. The NAC recommends the Census Bureau develop and share with the NAC the specific enumeration plans for each race and ethnic population, who are traditionally hard to count, as well as for those with non-traditional mailing addresses.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau's enumeration plan is to count everyone - regardless of ethnicity or race status. We have no specific enumeration plans for any given ethnicity or race group. However, we do have multiple and detailed efforts planned for many different types of hard-to-count populations, as documented in Appendix B of the 2020 Operational Plan at <https://www.census.gov/programs-surveys/decennial-census/2020-census/planning-management/planning-docs/operational-plan.html>.

14. The NAC recommends that data from the post enumeration survey include information about the undercounts of young children, people experiencing homelessness and housing instability, LGBTQ people, renters, and other communities that have historically been undercounted in addition to data about the undercounts of racial and ethnic groups at the lowest level of detail possible.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau agrees that there is interest in coverage estimates by the categories suggested. In general, the Census Bureau plans to publish coverage estimates by classifications used for the 2010 Census Coverage Measurement, including national breakdowns by age category, tenure, race, Hispanic origin, and sex.

Because there is no consensus regarding the definition of homelessness, coverage estimates of the population experiencing homelessness are not possible.

15. The NAC requests the number of households by ethnicity and race that participated in the End to End test by self-response mode, and through NRFU.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau is working to post the final reports from all intercensal tests on its website but cannot offer a timetable at this time.

Section II. Privacy and Confidentiality Protection Overview & Proposed 2020 Data Products Plan

1. The NAC recommends that to the maximum extent feasible and consistent with privacy requirements, data in an AIAN Summary File be publicly released.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

We will continue to update NAC and other stakeholders on the development of our 2020 Census data products consistent with our privacy protection requirements.

2. The NAC recommends that the Census Bureau make every effort to provide 2020 data products with race and Hispanic origin data that are as detailed as possible, and that are more detailed than the OMB Directive 15 categories.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

We will continue to update NAC and other stakeholders on the dissemination plans for race and Hispanic-origin data in 2020 Census data products consistent with our privacy protection requirements.

3. NAC recommends that the Census Bureau hold a special meeting of the NAC in July 2019 to focus on differential privacy and planned data products.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau does not agree with the recommendation to have an additional meeting on differential privacy and planned data products. We continue to research and assess possible solutions for tabulating desired 2020 Census data products with detailed race and Hispanic-origin data and are planning a National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine (NAS) panel workshop in December, 2019 to discuss the technical solutions. The public workshop will feature presentations by a multidisciplinary group of experts to help the Census Bureau better understand the uses of the data products and the importance of these uses. The discussion will help inform the Census Bureau's decisions on the final specification of 2020 data products.

4. The NAC recommends that the Census Bureau present its plans for 2020 data products to the major social-science and statistical professional associations (e.g. the Population Association of America, the American Sociological Association), explaining the "differential privacy" approach, and seek their members' input as those plans are being developed.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

Throughout the remainder of this year, we plan to continue conducting outreach and engagement with key stakeholders to determine their critical data needs. This feedback, in conjunction with feedback received from the Federal Register notice, will contribute to the data product planning.

5. NAC recommends face-to-face tribal consultations between Bureau staff and tribal leaders regarding implications of differential privacy and disclosure avoidance on AIAN data, including AIAN Summary File.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau recognizes the importance of consulting on this topic with tribal leaders and experts. We are currently conducting outreach and engagement with tribal leaders and experts regarding the implications of differential privacy on AIAN data. The Census Bureau developed a schedule of tribal consultations that began in September with a National Webinar and two formal tribal consultation meetings that were held at the 2019 Alaska Tribal Leaders Conference in Fairbanks, Alaska, and during the 2019 National Congress of American Indians Annual Convention in Albuquerque, New Mexico, in October.

6. The NAC recommends that the census find a way to provide researchers the PUMS data needed to produce important scholarship examining demographic data.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

We will continue to update NAC and other stakeholders on the development of our 2020 Census data products consistent with our privacy protection requirements.

7. The NAC recommends that the Census Bureau publicly commit to protect aggregate data that has not been disclosure-protected from being revealed to anyone outside the Bureau whether inside or outside the federal government. The Bureau should explain that it views this commitment as required by law because such aggregate data can be manipulated, with access to outside data sources, to identify individual and/or household data provided in the Census.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The confidentiality guarantee in Title 13 is the basis of our commitment not to publish identifying data. We only publish summary statistics. First, our policies and statistical safeguards help us ensure the confidentiality of the aggregated data before its dissemination. A second layer of protection comes from the perspective of IT security. The design of the IT systems also addresses the defense against and containment of cyber threats. From the beginning of the data collection process through the final storage of information, we protect respondent data following industry best practices and federal requirements.

Furthermore, our communications campaign, across all phases, will stress confidentiality, as we believe it is key toward cooperation and response. We do not share any nondisclosure-protected information with any individual or entity outside of the Census Bureau that is not sworn to uphold the confidentiality provisions of Title 13.

Section III. Update on Integrated Partnership and Communications Program

1. The NAC recommends that the census develop an outreach plan specifically around the citizenship issue including a plan for reaching non-citizens and communities with high immigrant populations (e.g., Latinos, Asians).

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The citizenship question is no longer on the questionnaire. Our Integrated Partnership and Communications Plan is creating paid advertising and outreach materials that emphasize the protection and confidentiality of Census Bureau data, which we know to be important for this population. That message will be included in traditional advertising, digital advertising and social media to encourage participation. The messages were created by Team Y&R's multicultural agencies who are experts in these audiences. The messages were tested with members of the public who represent those audiences. We also will continue working with trusted voices in local communities to encourage people to participate. We will hire locally ensuring that our staff speak the languages necessary to reach communities.

2. The NAC requests that the Census Bureau provide all outreach, publicity, and partnership materials to the NAC as they become available in electronic form.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

Outreach, publicity, and partnership materials are being posted on 2020census.gov and shared with the advisory committees, including NAC, as they become available.

3. The NAC recommends that the Census Bureau buys ethnic media and shares its media buy plan publicly.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

As done in 2010, the Census Bureau will post the media buy information that includes ethnic media buys on 2020census.gov once all negotiations have been completed. We plan to do this near the end of calendar year 2019.

4. The NAC recommends that the Census Bureau expeditiously develop a comprehensive communications and partnership plan to reach the immigrant, non-citizen population. The plan should aim to make messaging guidance and materials available as soon as possible; the messaging should be accessible, and responsive to concerns that have come to the bureau's attention from the immigrant, non-citizen population and from related communities. Confidentiality of Census data should be central to the plan, and concrete examples of how the Bureau would respond to threats to confidentiality should be employed as a part of the messaging.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

We recognize the importance of reaching this population, and our messaging will emphasize the protection and confidentiality of census data, particularly for this community. We also will explore opportunities to develop partnerships with organizations and people who serve

this population. However, we do not intend to develop a specific communications plan for this population. Rather, we will stress the safety and confidentiality of responses and emphasize that everyone must be included regardless of their citizenship status. For example, communications for the diverse mass audience will stress how easy it is to respond to the 2020 census and mention confidentiality, whereas communications for the Hispanic and Haitian audiences will stress confidentiality as an overarching message.

5. The NAC recommends that the Census Bureau immediately cease messaging that explains the inclusion of the citizenship question as necessary for voting rights enforcement. This is a message that undercuts trust in the Bureau because it is demonstrably false. It is also a message that has little or no appeal to non-voter non-citizens, which is the population most likely to be deterred from Census participation by the inclusion of the question.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

Given that the citizenship question is no longer on the 2020 Census questionnaire, this recommendation is now moot.

6. The NAC recommends that the Census Bureau develop and present to the NAC its strategic plans, including public messaging, to respond to any attempt from any source to discourage, deter, or intimidate specific population groups, such as undocumented immigrants, from participating in Census 2020. The Bureau plans should separately address threats motivated by protection of the target population and threats motivated by hostility or exclusion of the target population.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

We will discuss our strategies for addressing this issue with the NAC. You may find a link to our current web page on the subject of fraud (<https://2020census.gov/en/avoiding-fraud.html>). We intend to expand and improve this page in future iterations of the website. We also have an effort to combat misinformation and disinformation in which we are working with technology and social media companies to evaluate and implement their response options to those types of messaging. Those efforts include revising Terms of Service to include census violations and back end access to the companies to immediately detect and remove misinformation and disinformation. We have also established a Rumor Control Site that allows the public to report possible misinformation or disinformation directly to the Census Bureau. It also allows the Census Bureau to have a single location for the public to access to obtain the facts about any misinformation or disinformation efforts.

Section IV. 2020 Census Integrated Partnership Team Update

1. The NAC requests that the Census Bureau provide to the NAC the training materials it is using to train partnership specialists, tribal liaisons, address canvassers, and enumerators for the 2020 Census.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this request and will provide to the NAC training materials used to prepare partnership specialists, tribal liaisons, address canvassers (listers), and

enumerators for the 2020 Census. Many of the partnership training resources are available at <https://2020census.gov/en/partners/outreach-materials.html>.

2. The NAC recommends that upon request, Community Based Organizations (CBOs) from historically undercounted communities and tribal governments be designated to operate Questionnaire Assistance Centers (QACs) in local and tribal communities. If required, they should be allowed to serve in a sworn Title 13 capacity consistent with the Bureau's requirements for such capacity.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau thanks the NAC for this recommendation. The Census Bureau has developed a proposal in the event that funds are appropriated to support QACs. We request that community representatives apply and become temporary census employees through our online portal, 2020census.gov/jobs. We do not accept volunteers to do census jobs. Rather, we urge those with relevant experience in specific communities to apply for temporary census jobs in their area.

3. NAC recommends that the Census Bureau should improve the way it promotes job opportunities, especially for people with proficiency working with historically undercounted communities by having: (1) local Bureau staff proactively sharing postings with CBOs; (2) jobs posting being sortable by language and/or geographic area (as local as possible); and (3) creating opportunities to recruit and hire people in-person and not solely through an online recruitment and hiring process.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation. We will emphasize to local recruiting staff the importance of providing job information to CBOs and ensure that the CBOs are specifically provided information about positions for which we need language capabilities. We will also continue to attend job fairs and conduct other in-person recruiting for these positions.

4. NAC recommends the Census Bureau publicize and identify partnership specialists who speak languages — especially the ones beyond the 59 covered in a central, easy to access location.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau thanks the NAC for this recommendation. The Census Bureau has a general policy not to publicize and identify partnership specialists by name. Due to fluctuations in staffing and the need to ensure that newly hired partnership specialists are fully equipped and trained before engaging the public, we routinely only provide the name and contact information for the managers of partnership specialists. The Census Bureau has 1,558 partnership specialists on board/in queue (these figures reflect numbers as of October 10). Currently, about one-third are bilingual and fluent in a non-English language.

5. The NAC recommends that the specific focus of the 1.5 generation by the Integrated Partnerships team be broadened to include second generation children too (as their roles within their families mirror each other).

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation. The Integrated Partnership and Communications campaign includes focused outreach to many audiences, including households with members from the second generation and generation 1.5. When engaging potential partners, we are highlighting the vital role of these individuals in delivering messaging to their households as it relates to responding to the 2020 Census.

6. The NAC recommends that the Census Bureau work with the Health Resources and Services Administration (HRSA), to provide training so that counselors who speak directly with mothers who use WIC services, Head Start, FQHC, and other programs can provide assistance to help them complete the Census forms.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation. The Health Resources and Services Administration's Administrator (HRSA), George Sigounas, designated a senior HRSA point-of-contact, its director of communications, to coordinate outreach efforts with the Census Bureau. Census Bureau Communications and National Partnership staff are communicating with HRSA to discuss partnership activities.

7. The NAC recommends that the Community Partnership and Engagement program allocate financial and technical resources to support local partners to produce culturally sensitive information and promotional materials that reflect the diversity of historically undercounted populations like the Afro-Latinos, Haitians, and others within the African diaspora.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau understands that the NAC is asking for in-kind funding (known as the Partner Support Program), which we are not doing in 2020 as we did in 2000 and 2010. This program was largely funded by the American Recovery and Reinvestment Act of 2009 (ARRA) in 2010, which is not a funding source we have in 2020.

8. We recommend that partnership and communications' efforts include public campaigns to make it clear that confidentiality assurances mean the Bureau cannot share information with other government agencies. This is mentioned in some of the ads currently being tested for Spanish, but it would be useful to have this be a more central element of most communications that stress confidentiality.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation. The partnership and communications efforts, including the paid media campaign, will have messaging that addresses confidentiality.

Section V. Update on the undercount of Young Children Task Force

1. The NAC recommends that the Census outreach materials and messaging remind respondents about including “unrelated” children at every opportunity.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation. The messaging focused on the count of young children is included in advertising and partnership support materials.

2. The Communications and Partnerships Program have plans to include specific messaging. The NAC recommends these efforts must go to scale, and use additional available research from external partners and experts.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation. The Census Bureau and Team Y&R will continue to review third party data and available research from external partners and experts when developing messaging for our communications efforts in support of the 2020 Census.

3. Direct mailing in target areas is a major achievement. The NAC recommends the effort should go to scale and target areas made public to supplement outreach efforts.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau is still determining the target areas for the direct outreach mailer. The final scope of the effort will be determined based on multiple factors, including timing, budget, and existing operations in the target geography. It has not been determined if the areas will be publicly available. The timing of any such availability has not yet been determined.

4. More robust hard to count scores are very helpful. The NAC recommends more information on the development of scores is needed and should be added to ROAM.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau appreciates the desire to have more information in ROAM. The final methodology for generating a hard-to-count score for young children is still in development. The Census Bureau will take this recommendation under advisement and continue to keep the NAC informed.

5. The NAC would like to see greater transparency and clarity about the nature of the undercount of very young children. The 2010 Census had 2.2 million omissions. Different populations had different rates of undercount and overcount, and the NAC recommends that these require different approaches.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau appreciates the concern over the numbers that describe the count of young children balancing between total over-or undercount and net over-or undercount is a challenge when defining an issue and allocating limited resources to address it. We will

keep this in mind as we evaluate and communicate the coverage of young children in the 2020 Census. An [infographic](#) (see attachment) released last year acknowledges the extent of the undercount of young children, the reasons they are missed, and what partners can do to help ensure they are counted.

6. Questions remain on the procedures for Non-ID responses; the NAC recommends multiple non-ID responses should be allowed from households even when there is an initial self-response using an ID.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation. The Census Bureau has procedures to handle two or more responses at the same address, whether these responses originated using an ID, the non-ID process, or both.

7. The NAC recommends the Census optimize response ability via smart phones, given their prevalence in households with young children and preference for using this mode. Census should reinforce availability of paper and phone.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation. The internet self-response option has been optimized for mobile phones, and we are testing on a variety of devices. While there will not be an opportunity for NAC members to access the online questionnaire from their own phones, we may be able to provide a demonstration. We will reinforce the availability of non-internet response options (call-in, paper, and even in-person follow-up) throughout the communications campaign.

8. The NAC recommends the Census use the National Advisory Committee for additional input and feedback, and provide opportunity to review and comment on training materials for enumerators.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau thanks NAC for this recommendation. The Census Bureau will share with NAC the training materials for enumerators.

9. The NAC recommends the Census make Statistics in Schools more robust, expand more to Pre-K, with robust partnerships with Pre-K providers.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation. For the 2020 Census, the Statistics in Schools Program (SIS) will include a pre-K component. We have fully scaled this program so that all schools in the United States, Puerto Rico, Guam, the Virgin Islands, American Samoa, and the Commonwealth of the Northern Mariana Islands will receive materials. Materials for pre-K will include an activity-coloring book, worksheets, webisodes, a song and a lyric video. SIS is actively reaching out to organizations focused on educating young children to disseminate information about the pre-K program. Our partnership program is actively reaching out to and engaging pre-K providers. We held a National Kickoff event in Memphis, TN, on October 28, 2019.

10. The NAC recommends the Census create more partnerships with businesses to reach their clients through services and through products with message placement.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation. The Integrated Partnership and Communications campaign includes focused outreach to many audiences, including the business community, service providers, governments, and nonprofits.

11. The NAC recommends the Census create partnerships with state and local governments that provide services to young children and families.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation. The Integrated Partnership and Communications campaign includes focused outreach to many audiences, including the business community, service providers, governments, and nonprofits.

12. The NAC recommends the Census create partnerships with health services providers, including pre- and post-natal programs, pediatricians, and community clinics.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation. The Integrated Partnership and Communications campaign includes focused outreach to many audiences, including the business community, service providers, governments, and nonprofits.

13. The NAC recommends the Census create partnerships with service providers for elderly populations to reach multigenerational households.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation. The Integrated Partnership and Communications campaign includes focused outreach to many audiences, including the business community, service providers, governments, and nonprofits.

14. The NAC recommends the Census create partnerships with childcare licensing agencies for public and private foster care providers.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation. The Integrated Partnership and Communications campaign includes focused outreach to many audiences, including the business community, service providers, governments, and nonprofits.

15. The NAC recommends the Census work to improve data collection in the American Community Survey when it is reviewed in 2022, including research on respondents who omit children from the questionnaire roster.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau appreciates the recommendation to improve data collection for the American Community Survey (ACS), including work to ensure the reporting of all household members. The ACS program plans to conduct cognitive testing of new language for the household roster questions in 2019-2020. Results from this testing will inform the decision about whether to test revisions to the household roster in the field planned for 2022.

16. The NAC recommends the Census determine additional sources of high quality Administrative Records, including those maintained by state governments.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation and expects to continue to identify additional sources of high quality administrative records. The Census Bureau will continue efforts to identify, access, and evaluate administrative records from government and third party sources for potential inclusion in programs such as the ACS, demographic and economic surveys, research, and future censuses.

17. The NAC recommends the Census ensure the Post Enumeration Survey includes robust efforts to evaluate the count of very young children.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau is aware of the limitations and problems with 2010 Census Coverage Measurement (CCM) estimates of coverage for young children. The Census Bureau is implementing improvements for enumerating young children for both the 2020 Census and 2020 Post-Enumeration Survey, which should improve the coverage of the census counts and the quality of the dual system estimates of young children.

18. The NAC recommends that the Census Bureau consider outreach to ethnic and bilingual language schools (many of which operate on the weekends) which have pre-K as well as K-12, in addition to K-12 charter schools.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation and will submit it to the various outreach teams that can contact these organizations. The Statistics in School team is working with associations for charter schools and bilingual education, and the Census Bureau welcomes additional suggestions the NAC has for specific partners in ethnic language schools.

19. The NAC recommends the Census Bureau provide training and resources to complete count committees on how to use the ROAM data to identify geographic areas with high rates of historically undercount communities, including high rates of household complexity and young child undercount.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation. Currently, the Census Bureau has a robust website that describes the ROAM and provides resources for using this website. In addition, the Census Bureau has recorded a live webinar training in Census Academy (on census.gov) hosted by the Geography Division that is a ROAM training. It has been provided to all of the partnership specialists and leadership in the regional offices since

2017. All data dissemination specialists are also trained in ROAM and many have participated already in training complete count committees (CCCs) on use of the tool. The current model has data dissemination specialists and partnership specialists working together on training the complete count committees in many regions. We will continue this model and supplement using data dissemination specialists' expertise where CCCs request it to focus their outreach efforts.

Additional Resources:

- *Using the ROAM to Locate and Learn about Hard-To-Count Areas (recorded webinar along with the transcript) User Guides, Data Dictionary, FAQs, Quick Tip Guides, and Factsheets*

20. The NAC recommends the Census Bureau test messaging used for overall census completion that speaks to the importance of making sure all children are counted.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation. The advertising campaign includes messaging about the importance of making sure all children are counted. That messaging was tested in focus groups.

21. The NAC recommends that the working group for the undercount of young children be renewed through 2021.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation

Section VI. Integrated Partnership and Communications Working Group Update

1. Message Timing

- a) The length of the Awareness phase for historically undercounted communities is inadequate to address the concerns surfaced during the evaluation of the 2010 Census outreach strategy; therefore, the NAC recommends beginning the Awareness phase 8 weeks earlier than currently scheduled.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

Thank you for your recommendation. The Integrated Partnership and Communications Campaign relies on everything from paid advertising to the local outreach conducted by partnership specialists. The campaign started with the Strategic Early Education Phase, which has been ongoing since October 2018. That was followed by the Awareness Phase which has already started. Partnership specialists are in the field, every day, working in communities to explain what the census is and why it is important to respond. They work specifically within hard-to-count communities to increase awareness and understanding of the census and encourage the public to spread these messages to others in an effort to increase participation. They have also been working diligently to assist localities and states in starting up CCCs. Our partners are another important source of information as they spread to their customers, employees and constituents about the 2020 Census. The paid media campaign communicates broad

messaging through national channels and speaks to numerous audiences including hard-to-count populations.

- b) A number of historically undercounted groups will only be reached through “diverse mass” messaging, including parents of very young children, English-speaking racial and ethnic groups, LGBTQ people, and low-income people. Given the concerns surfaced during the evaluation of the 2010 Census outreach strategy, the NAC recommends beginning the Awareness phase for “diverse mass” 8 weeks earlier than currently scheduled, with a focus on media that will reach those historically undercounted communities that are included in the “diverse mass” audience.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

Thank you for your recommendation. The Integrated Partnership and Communications Campaign relies on everything from paid advertising to the local outreach conducted by partnership specialists. The campaign started with the Strategic Early Education Phase, which has been ongoing since October 2018. That was followed by the Awareness Phase which has already started. Partnership specialists are in the field, every day, working in communities to explain what the census is and why it is important to respond. They work specifically within hard-to-count communities to increase awareness and understanding of the census and encourage the public to spread these messages to others in an effort to increase participation. They have also been working diligently to assist localities and states in starting up CCCs. Our partners are another important source of information as they spread to their customers, employees and constituents about the 2020 Census. The paid media campaign communicates broad messaging through national channels and speaks to numerous audiences including hard-to-count populations.

2. Message Content

- a) The addition of the citizenship question to the 2020 Census is one of the primary concerns people have about the 2020 Census, and according to the Bureau’s own analysis of the change will have a significant impact on both overall response and self-response. Given the Communications strategy’s goal of encouraging all people to self-respond in the mode they prefer, the NAC requests that communications materials must directly address the citizenship question regardless of the outcome of pending cases in the Supreme Court. After the court decision, the NAC requests that we be briefed and consulted regarding how Census will proceed, including seeing the outreach materials pertaining to citizenship question.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

With the removal of the citizenship question from the questionnaire, specific messaging is unnecessary. Our messaging will emphasize the importance and safety of answering the 2020 Census for everyone, including noncitizens, which has always been our fundamental objective.

- b) The Bureau must anticipate the complex definition of “citizenship” in tribal, Native Hawaiian, and Pacific Islander communities. If the Census includes a citizenship question, the NAC recommends the Census specifically address that complexity in its

communications materials.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The citizenship question is no longer on the questionnaire for the 2020 Census.

- c) Given the need for messaging on confidentiality to resonate with historically undercounted groups, the NAC recommends that the Bureau share the specifics of its planned messaging on confidentiality with the NAC for review and feedback as soon as possible.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau cannot support this recommendation. Our messaging for the advertising campaign went through extensive testing and is currently in production. Our partnership materials supporting this issue are on our website, and we welcome feedback from the NAC on this messaging.

- d) Although funding for law enforcement services may be important to many Census respondents, for others it is seen as a harmful and triggering institution. Because other services like hospitals, fire departments, roads, and schools are likely to be less polarizing than law enforcement, the NAC strongly recommends - despite findings from the CBAMS survey - avoiding the use of law enforcement in communications materials.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau appreciates your recommendation.

- e) The individual focus of the tagline (Shape Your Future) may be less appealing to many hard to count communities than a collective focus (Shape Our Future). In fact, much of the messaging research conducted to date indicated that historically undercounted communities are motivated to respond to the Census by better understanding the collective benefit of the survey, rather than by any individual benefit. Therefore, the NAC recommends tailoring the tagline along with the text of messages in materials meant to reach communities that resonate better with a collective message.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau appreciates this recommendation. We have already taken this action for the 2020 American Indian and Alaska Native and the Native Hawaiian and Pacific Islander taglines changing them to "Shape Our Future" based on research that these populations resonate with the concept of making important decisions for their family, not as individuals. However, our tagline went through extensive testing which demonstrated that for other audiences, including other hard-to-count audiences, the tagline resonated.

- f) For all communications materials - including video advertisements and print advertisements – the NAC recommends the Census use only images that are relevant, current, and respectful to all hard to count populations.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation. We are actively working with multi-cultural subcontractors throughout the lifecycle of the campaign to ensure that all advertisements produced for 2020 are culturally relevant, appropriate, and respectful to all hard-to-count populations.

- g) The NAC recommends that the messaging directed to the AIAN population should address the full range of AIAN people, including urban Indian, reservation-based Indian and Alaska Native populations, those who identify with multiple tribes or villages, as well as AIAN people that identify as multi-racial.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau welcomes your recommendation. Our outreach strategy reflects the diversity of this audience.

- h) Because the general public is likely to learn information about the Census from both the Integrated Partnerships and Communications campaign and from traditional media, the NAC recommends that it is important that there be increased coordination between the communications contractors and any earned media regarding administrative records or other Census issues.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation. Team Y&R is the prime contractor for the entire Integrated Partnership and Communications Campaign. Team Y&R is engaged in the full suite of work supporting the campaign from national partnerships to earned media to paid advertising. Team Y&R, staff from our Communications Directorate (including national partnership staff), and staff from our Community Partnership and Engagement Program work daily to integrate their operations and messaging to ensure consistency on all of the issues relevant to the 2020 Census including those related to administrative records.

- i) The NAC requests information: Please clarify the Census Bureau's threshold for the use of "crisis communications" funds, including how this threshold applies in the context of Administrative Records use.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

While there is contingency funding within our budget, we are not establishing thresholds ahead of time to drive the allocation of this funding. We will use contingency funding, if necessary and as directed by the leadership team based on recommendations from the managers of the communications campaign. The Census Bureau will be monitoring operational and communications campaign metrics to optimize its advertising, media relations, and partnership activities throughout peak operations.

3. Segmentation Models

- a) The NAC recommends against using a segmentation model that is inadequately nuanced to effectively reach hard to count communities. Specific information about language, race, ethnicity, income, and other factors is critical to designing a communications' strategy that is effective.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau appreciates the feedback. Based on past NAC recommendations, the Census Bureau used all variables for the segmentation solution. The Census Bureau believes the segmentation effectively targets different hard-to-count groups.

- b) The NAC strongly recommends not adding segment names from the segmentation model to public-facing sites like ROAM. If segmentation models are used on public-facing sites, the Census Bureau should ensure that the terms used to identify market segments do not promote stereotypes.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau is dedicated to creating public tools that do not promote stereotypes or contain potentially deleterious language. Audience segment names are currently available on the Census Bureau's website and the ROAM but have been updated from their initiation presentation and from 2010.

4. Evaluation

- a) The Integrated Communications and Partnerships plan for the 2020 Census was built in part based on learning from the evaluation of the 2010 Census communications strategy. The NAC strongly encourages the Bureau to conduct a robust evaluation of the 2020 communications strategy that centers on the efficacy of outreach to and motivation of historically undercounted communities.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation. We are currently exploring our options for evaluating the Integrated Partnership and Communications Program.

5. HTC Groups in Diverse Mass

- a) A broad range of historically undercounted/hard to count groups are a part of the Bureau's generally defined "diverse mass" audience, for example Puerto Ricans that live on the mainland, people with young children, Native Hawaiian and Pacific Islanders that live on the mainland, LGBTQ people, 2nd and 3rd generation immigrants, Afro-Latinos, persons with disabilities, and people with very low-incomes. The NAC recommends that the Bureau create and share publicly – including identifying them as "plans"- specific plans for how it intends to reach these and other historically underrepresented communities using the resources dedicated to "diverse mass" outreach.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau does not agree with the recommendation. As part of the communications plan version 2.0, we will detail how our holistic communications plan is reaching the public, including many hard-to-count populations. We are reaching the HTC populations identified by the NAC across the campaign, including through earned media, social media, Statistics in Schools and the partnership program.

- b) The segment of the Latino population that consumes media in predominantly English requires a unique outreach and education approach. The campaign in Spanish will not

reach this segment of the population, which constitutes the majority of the 55 million Latinos in the country. The NAC recommends that this population requires messaging that is appropriate for a HTC group, separate from the “Diverse Mass” messaging.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts the recommendation. In addition to the Diverse mass messaging, the Census Bureau and Team Y&R will develop materials for English dominant Latinos via digital channels.

6. Language Access

The Bureau’s current outreach plans have a limited reach in communities with language access needs. For example, the plan includes no South Asian languages, no Native Hawaiian or Pacific Islander languages, limited outreach in Navajo and no other AIAN languages, and has major gaps in groups with a large quantity of people with limited English proficiency. Regarding its in-language materials, the NAC recommends:

- a) Resources for language outreach should include smaller populations at high risk of being missed by the general market approach.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau appreciates your recommendation. The Census Bureau and Team Y&R will develop materials and messaging in English and 12 non-English languages to support the Integrated Partnership and Communications Program.

Although the Paid Media Campaign currently plans to advertise in media that accept advertising in the 13 languages supported by the advertising contract, the Census Bureau will provide language guides in 59 languages. Additional information can be found at https://census.gov/programs-surveys/decennial-census/2020-census/planning-management/memo-series/2020-memo-2018_06.html.

The 12 non-English languages were selected based on data demonstrating what languages people spoke while not speaking English very well in more than 60,000 households. Partners and stakeholders can assist by conducting outreach in additional language in communities in which they work.

- b) If paid advertising is restricted to those languages supported by language support system, the Bureau should work to expand the list of languages and dialects covered by the paid advertising campaign.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau appreciates your recommendation. Rather than have the paid advertising campaign cover these languages, we are planning to have them covered through our partnership specialists in the Community Partnership and Engagement Program.

- c) If the partnerships plan is intended to cover gaps in outreach to people with limited English proficiency, the Bureau should concentrate additional resources to that program

to translate existing materials and provide support in language and dialect to local communities.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

Our current plan is to translate communications and partnership materials into the 12 languages supported by Integrated Partnership and Communications Program and also available in online and phone response. In addition, the website will offer landing pages with appropriate content in 59 non-English languages, complete with instructions on how to complete the census. We do not have plans to support additional translations and must rely on our 2020 Census partners to provide this support.

7. Stakeholder Input

- a) The NAC recommends that the Census reconvene the IPC Working Group for an in-person meeting, and invite additional NAC and CSAC members, as soon as possible, but no later than September, to provide an opportunity for in-depth report and discussion on Media Plan 2.0., confidentiality issues, plans regarding citizenship question, and other critical communications updates.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

While we appreciated the input from the IPC Working Group, rather than reconvening them, we propose to invite the entire NAC to come to Suitland in December for a "one-way briefing" to review rough cuts of the 2020 paid advertising materials, along with a walk through of the census operational timeline.

- b) The NAC recommends the Census provide regular written updates to the IPC Working Group on progress to the goals outlined in the communications strategy.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

We agree to conduct in person one-way briefings with the working group, and we will work to schedule this in the near future. We will schedule additional one-way briefings after the next NAC meeting.

- c) For each and every non-English communication that Y&R prepares, the NAC recommends that the ad/material make it explicit and clear that the census form can be completed in the language of the communication piece (whenever that is true).

CENSUS RESPONSE:

Many of the treatments in the campaign in languages other than English will make this point, as will other communications materials.

8. The NAC recommends the Census Bureau provide demonstrations of its initiatives, including messaging videos, distribution materials, and census surveys, ideally at its July 2019 meeting.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

We plan to provide an update on each component of the Integrated Partnership and Communications Campaign to the IPC working group in our meeting with them in the fall.

We also will update the NAC at the meeting scheduled for November 2019.

Section VIII. General Recommendation

1. Because there are 9 valued and experienced members of the NAC whose second terms are ending in August and this will greatly reduce the number of members, the NAC recommends that the Census Bureau invite these departing members of the NAC to serve on the NAC for at least one year which would allow the NAC and the Bureau to benefit from their input through the decennial Census.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

Thank you for your recommendation to extend terms for the nine members whose terms are expired in August. The Census Bureau did not agree with this recommendation. We do look forward to continued engagements with the departing members through opportunities as available to the valued community of stakeholders.

2. The NAC recommends that the four members whose first term expires be reappointed for a second three-year term.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau also deemed it appropriate to extend these terms and those extensions have been completed.

3. The next NAC meeting is scheduled for November 2019. There are several outstanding issues and program operations requiring NAC and Census Bureau engagement. The NAC recommends interim discussions and engagement with the Census Bureau before the fall meeting to provide input and obtain clarification on Census direction. The NAC specifically requests a conversation with the Census immediately after the SCOTUS decision, regardless of the final determination of the court.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

Thank you for your recommendation.

4. The NAC recommends the Census Bureau develop a contact tree or other mechanism to alert NAC members of disinformation during the 2020 Census so that our communities can be alerted immediately of fake news, misinformation or any other social media threats to an accurate Census.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

Thank you for the recommendation. We have created a Rumor Control Page on our website to quickly disseminate factual content in response to misinformation and disinformation. It includes an email address rumors@census.gov for the public to report possible misinformation and disinformation. Upon learning of misinformation and disinformation, the Census Bureau contacts stakeholders, including this Committee when appropriate, through the Census Bureau's Advisory Committee Branch.

Section IX. Requests for Information

1. The NAC requests that the Census Bureau identify what steps, if any, it has taken in response to issues identified in the OIG Report beyond those identified in “Issues observed during the 2018 End-to-End Census Test’s address canvassing operation indicate risk to address list quality.”

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau accepts this recommendation, [see attached document](#): 2020 Census: Issues Observed During the 2018 End-to-End Census Test’s Address Canvassing Operation Indicate Risk to Address List Quality

2. How will incomplete forms, missing responses to one or more questions be handled? Is there any weighting or another statistical technique such as sampling which will be used to account for missing responses?

CENSUS RESPONSE:

The Census Bureau has no current plans to use weighting or statistical sampling for missing values for sex, age, Hispanic origin, race, relationship to householder, and tenure. However, other statistical techniques will be used for missing responses via our characteristic editing and imputation process to ensure that every census record has a valid and consistent response for every person counted in the 2020 Census. For instance, the characteristic editing and imputation process will employ the use of other demographic information provided by the respondent on the census form; the use of previous census records and other administrative records data from the respondent (such as their responses from the American Community Survey or past census forms); the use of responses from another person within the same housing unit (within-household); and finally, the use of responses from a person in a nearby housing unit (nearest neighbor hotdeck).

3. The NAC requests that the Census Bureau provide the demographic breakdown of the partnership specialists by region, gender, and race and ethnicity.

CENSUS RESPONSE:

We are unable to provide specific demographic breakdowns of our employees as that would be a violation of Title 5, U.S.C. Effective October 10, there were 1,372 partnership specialists on board at the regional census centers. The rest are in queue awaiting various stages of security clearance.